| **Student Name:** Shawn Nip |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Fair opening! Good work tying the narrative to a clear grounded action. We could characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals.  In signposting, just say set-up and then the titles of your arguments, when you get to set-up, say 3 things here…  Set-up   * Good explanation of the counter-narrative. * You need to spend time characterising the way in which this narrative impacts people in the status quo to pinpoint what the problem characterisation is. Is it that people make bad decisions, or they glorify suffering because they think this is just part of the process? * Good use of examples; the extreme instances you say this debate isn’t about are unnecessary! * Burden should be more specific - to prove that this narrative leads to burnout, resentment, and an unhealthy obsession with the end goal. You could push the counterfactual of a balanced approach that prioritizes well-being and enjoyment is more sustainable and ultimately more likely to lead to success.   Argument 1   * Explain why sacrifice is unnecessary! You assert this, but need to explain how this is untrue. * We just assume this is true; you need to break down how this is a false premise. What kinds of things are sacrificed in the status quo, that do not need to be. We didn’t prove this! * What kinds of decisions do people make and how is this bad and what we do not want on our side? * What one person considers a sacrifice, another might view as an opportunity cost or a simple choice. You could argue that the narrative of "necessary sacrifice" puts undue pressure on individuals and promotes a narrow view of success.   We could have also spent time explaining how this narrative convinces people that their dreams have very high costs and hence should not even pursue them in the first place.  We can argue how this narrative disproportionately hurts the underprivileged - people are led to believe equal amounts of sacrifice go in, but how true is this?  05:30 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Boris Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Don’t use a rhetorical question! Explain how this sacrifice is unnecessary - break this down and talk about the pressure people put themselves under when they buy into this narrative.  Structure? You should say - one argument in this speech…  Argument 1   * Thesis? What is the impact? What are you trying to prove or achieve? * Good on the idea of everything being fine after; that this holds dreams up very highly. * We could characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals.   You need to spend time characterising the way in which this narrative impacts people in the status quo to pinpoint what the problem characterisation is. Is it that people make bad decisions, or they glorify suffering because they think this is just part of the process?  What kinds of decisions do people make and how is this bad and what we do not want on our side?  What one person considers a sacrifice, another might view as an opportunity cost or a simple choice. You could argue that the narrative of "necessary sacrifice" puts undue pressure on individuals and promotes a narrow view of success.  We could have also spent time explaining how this narrative convinces people that their dreams have very high costs and hence should not even pursue them in the first place.  We can argue how this narrative disproportionately hurts the underprivileged - people are led to believe equal amounts of sacrifice go in, but how true is this?  02:34 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Lilianna Poon |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Not tracking 1st Prop in any context is criminal. This is the best explanation of the case from the other side. You have to engage, you have to communicate with your teammates in prep time.  Our opening needs to challenge their problem characterisation that sacrifice is unnecessary. Is this true?  Rebuttal   * We cannot do speaker by speaker rebuttal. Synthesise the contributions from 1st and 2nd into 2-3 key points. * Why is it true that sacrifice is necessary? * Why would people give up instantly? * POI - answer directly! What sacrifices? What dreams? Our language is super vague here.   Argument 1   * You need to explain how this narrative is necessary in the status quo - that people think dreams are easy to achieve, and throw their all into them without thinking of what the consequences will be. Your side checks them and holds them accountable. * How does it prepare them? What would their behaviour be like in the counter-factual? * In narrative debates, a chunk of preparation time needs to be about thinking of examples that are relevant. It took us a really long time to come up with an example where asked a POI!   We speak too slowly. We need to speak faster and build up more of a rhythm. You need to use hand gestures, have facial expressions and vary your tone and pace.  05:24 | | | | | | |